

THE TRANSLATION OF IMPLICIT COMPLIMENTS IN SUBTITLE OF *BUMI MANUSIA*: CROSS-CULTURAL PRAGMATICS

Alfira Andini Damayanti, Emy Sudarwati

Universitas Brawijaya (UB), Malang, Indonesia

E-mail: andini30@student.ub.ac.id

Received: 2024-11-15

Accepted: 2024-12-11

Published: 2024-12-20

Abstract

Implicit compliments were one of the speech acts forms, often found in high-context cultures such as Indonesia, in which implicitly attributed credit to someone other than the speaker, conveying admiration indirectly. The study aimed to provide a new perspective that not only contributed to the existing literature on cross-cultural pragmatics and translation studies, but also addressed the possible challenges posed by implicit compliments in movie translation in terms of Indonesian cultural context. The data for this study were collected by watching the movie *"Bumi Manusia"* on Netflix, observing both the original Indonesian dialogue and the English subtitles. Through the analysis, the study identified two main types of implicit compliments, those referring to achievements and those involving comparisons based on Boyle's (2000) framework. From the 28 data collected, the findings indicated that translators employed several translation procedures proposed by Newmark (1988), such as modulation, transposition, transference, and cultural equivalence to convey the meaning of implicit compliments. Furthermore, this study also highlighted the inherent challenges associated with the translation of implicit compliments, particularly in terms of cultural and linguistic aspects, including symbolic cultural meaning, language structure, and culturally specific terms.

Keywords: *Cross-cultural pragmatics; implicit compliments; translation*

1. Introduction

Language reflects a nation's identity. It has characteristics that distinguish the identity of a country or region from others, one of which is in terms of giving and receiving compliments. Indonesia is the second country in the world with the largest number of languages after Papua New Guinea (Collins, 2019), which creates many characteristics in the area of giving and receiving compliments among its people. Bruti (2006) states that speech acts such as compliments are subject to sociolinguistic and cultural variations, and the differences in giving and receiving compliments can be observed across languages with cross-cultural pragmatics approach.

Pragmatics is a branch of linguistics' study that is concerned with meaning, or it can be referred to as the study of language in context (Stadler, 2018). It is focuses on person's ability to derive meanings from specific kinds of speech situations to recognize what the

speaker referring to (Kreidler, 2002). Pragmatics is frequently delineated as adhering to two distinct traditions. The first is the Anglo-American tradition, which is closely related to the philosophy of language and is concerned with theories of implicature and presupposition, speech acts, deixis, and so forth. The second is the European, which takes a broad view of the act of communicating meaning in context. It also includes the study of language in use from a social and cultural perspective. In translation studies, interest has gradually shifted from the Anglo-American view to a broader European-Continental approach (Dayter, Locher, & Messerli, 2023). The relationship between pragmatics and culture is of particular significance in understanding how people engage in communicative practices and interpret the meaning conveyed by the speaker. Cultural norms play a crucial role in shaping the expression of politeness and directness or indirectness in speech, which in turn affects how meaning is interpreted in different contexts. For instance, the practice of offering indirect or implicit compliments may be more prevalent in certain cultures, such as Indonesia, as a means of maintaining harmony. Conversely, in other cultures, offering explicit or direct compliments may be preferred. This dynamic intersection between language and cultural practices is essential for a comprehensive understanding of cross-cultural pragmatics.

This study examines implicit compliments in the Indonesian movie, "*Bumi Manusia*" or "*The Earth of Mankind*," directed by Hanung Bramantyo and adapted from Pramoedya Ananta Toer's acclaimed novel. Set during Indonesia's colonial era, the movie presents a rich narrative of cultural identity and societal challenges. It offers an excellent framework for analyzing the nuances of implicit compliments and their translation into English, shedding light on cross-cultural communication in historical and cultural contexts.

Previous researchers have already conducted in the field of compliments and translations. Widyanita and Pasaribu (2019) found that compliments in '*Me Before You*' predominantly express admiration, align with Arimbi (2021) finding that compliments in movie '*The Spectacular Now*' focus on appearance, ability, and personality to express admiration and reinforce social connections. There has been progress in research on compliment in movies, by examining the giving of compliment and also the response to the compliment carried out by Fristando (2022), who analyses politeness strategies in giving and responding to compliments by two movies' characters, '*Fundamentals of Caring*' and '*Wonder*,' highlighting that both movies predominantly use positive politeness strategies, including giving gifts, exaggerating interest, approval, and sympathy to deliver their compliments and use some of strategies in response the compliments, including appreciation token, praise upgrade, comment history, comment acceptance, return, scale down, question, disagreement, and no acknowledgement.

In terms of translation, Sudarto et al. (2020) finds that translating English into Indonesian for *National Geographic* TV Shows requires cultural adjustment, as evidenced by the careful selection of words and translation techniques, including the adjustment of language, idioms, word choices, unit systems, and daily expressions. Moreover, Renna (2023) examined the untranslatability of Chinese and English forms of address in subtitles by analyzing from TV series 女心理师 (*The Psychologist*), revealing the challenges in finding the best choice in translating hierarchy terms like 老师 (*lǎoshī*) and 小 (*xiǎo*) into English, which increasingly avoids hierarchical titles. Other than these studies, Afandi and Authar (2021); Saputra et al. (2022); Saragih and Manullang (2023) discuss the translation techniques in movie subtitles, including adaptation, amplification, borrowing, calque, compensation,

description, discursive creation, established equivalence, generalization, linguistic amplification, linguistic compression, literal translation, modulation, particularization, reduction, substitution, transposition, variation, direct translation strategy, retention strategy, specification strategy, omission strategy, and official equivalent strategy.

This study builds on previous research to address noteworthy gaps in the field of compliment and translation studies. By using the same research object, movie, this study will focus more on implicit compliments, a topic that is currently under-researched, because its closely related to norms and culture, so researchers need to understand the cultural context well so as not to cause misperception. Therefore, this study focuses on this aspect, using Indonesian as the Source Language (SL) and English as the Target Language (TL), and aims to investigate: (1) What types of implicit compliments are found in the *"Bumi Manusia"* movie? (2) What translation procedures are used in translating the implicit compliments? And (3) What possible challenges are likely to be faced by translators in translating the implicit compliments?

Through an in-depth examination of the movie *"Bumi Manusia,"* the researchers aim to provide a new perspective related to translation of implicit compliments that not only contributes to the existing literature on cross-cultural pragmatics and translation studies, but also addresses the possible challenges posed by implicit compliments in movie translation in terms of Indonesian cultural context. The results of this study are expected to serve as a basis for further research on the same topic or for comparison with different genres of movies or novels and different target languages.

2. Literature Review

Pragmatics, as a branch of linguistics, plays a vital role in understanding how meaning is conveyed in context, especially in cross-cultural communication. Levinson (2003) defines pragmatics as a follow:

1. Pragmatics is the study between language and context that are grammaticalized, or encoded in the structure of a language.
2. Pragmatics is the study of the relations between language and context that are basic to an account of language understanding.
3. Pragmatics is the study of the ability of language users to pair sentences with the contexts in which they would be appropriate.
4. Pragmatics is the study of deixis, implicature, presupposition, speech acts, and aspects of discourse structure.

Building on this understanding of pragmatics, cross-cultural pragmatics further explores how individuals from different cultural backgrounds interpret and negotiate meaning based on their cultural norms and contextual knowledge. In this context, "cross-cultural" literally means "between cultures", referring to the negotiation of meaning across different cultures. This definition does not refer to the study of issues relating to people communicating across cultural boundaries, but rather to the study of issues relating to intracultural communication (Stadler, 2018).

In social relations, the establishment of positive relationships is of paramount importance. One effective method for fostering such relationships is through the act of offering a compliment. Holmes (1988) posited that a compliment can be conceptualised as a

speech act, which explicitly or implicitly attributes credit to someone other than speaker, usually the person addressed, for some 'good' (possession, characteristic, skill, etc.) which positively valued by the speaker and the hearer. Importantly, explicit compliments are directly expressed, such as "You look great in that outfit," whereas implicit compliments convey praise indirectly, often requiring contextual interpretation. For instance, saying, "You always find the best solutions," can function as an implicit compliment depending on the context. The use of compliments, which is a type of positive communication, is extremely important in the social interactions in Indonesia. One of the most essential and common functions of compliments is to reinforce and enhance the bond of solidarity between the speaker and the hearer. There are several functions of compliments adapted from Wu (2008):

1. To express admiration or approval of someone's work or appearance or taste.
2. To establish, confirm, and maintain solidarity.
3. To replace greetings/ gratitude/ apologize/ congratulations.
4. To soften face-threatening acts such as apologize, requests and criticism.
5. To open and sustain conversation.

In light of the aforementioned explication of the function of giving compliments, it can be posited that compliment is an utterance that is directed towards the purpose of satisfying the speech partner.

Indonesia is one of country used high-context cultures communication which a significant proportion of communication is implicit, relying heavily on contextual cues, nonverbal communication, and shared understandings among individuals. According to Hall (1976) these cultures tend giving a simple message with profound implications, as a considerable proportion of their interactions are based on non-verbal communication and implicit understandings. Thus, the same can be said of the act of offering a compliment. For instance, Javanese society is characterized by a reluctance to disclose one's emotional state to others, as well as a tendency to refrain from external and internal emotional expression. Additionally, Javanese people seldom employ direct speech to convey their intentions, whether in the form of requests, disapproval, or a will (Wulansari, 2019). Consequently, the utilisation of indirect speech enhances the likelihood of misinterpretation in interpreting interlocutors' statements, particularly when translating implicit compliment from a movie, which necessitates a range of competencies to convey the correct meaning from the SL to the TL.

A wealth of studies has been conducted on compliments and translations. For instance, Agustiyani (2020) investigated compliment strategies used by the judges in Indonesian and American Idol 2019, which found that there are three types of compliment strategy used by the judges in Indonesian Idol: explicit compliment (53%), followed by implicit compliment (41%) and non-compliment (6%). On the other hand, the strategy that is mostly used by the judges in American Idol is implicit compliment (59%), followed by explicit compliment (36%) and non-compliment (5%). From the research, it can be said that the way the American judges gave compliments on the singing competition show is at odds with the cultural reflection of Western people, who are supposed to be more direct in the way they speak.

In 2023, there was research development conducted by Puspitasari and Fauziati that analysed the compliment expression found in the movie entitled '*Afterlife of the Party.*' In

the research, the researchers found 5 types of linguistic from the movie; 4 topics of compliment based on Holmes (1996); and 5 functions of compliment using Wu (2008) classification.

Furthermore, in the field of translation, Susini (2020) explored how implicit meanings in Indonesian texts are translated into English from a book of Indonesian short stories entitled '*Mandi Api*' and its translation in English entitled '*Ordeal by Fire*.' The study found that while some implicit constructions were preserved in English, others were rendered with explicit meanings. Although the source text and target text have different constructions in the translations studied, the meaning of the source text is successfully conveyed into English.

Chai, Ong, Amini, and Ravindran (2022) examined the strategies and challenges involved in translating Chinese cultural items into English subtitles. The most effective translation strategies were identified as omission, direct transfer, equivalence, and adaptation. Additionally, the main challenges in audiovisual translation were highlighted as technical, cultural, and linguistic. The researchers also stated that accent and pronunciation, as well as grammatical errors in dialogue that must be corrected in the subtitles, necessitate specialised knowledge and skill from the subtitler and translator.

3. Research Method

This study adopted the descriptive-qualitative method to analyze the translation of implicit compliments in the subtitles of the movie "*Bumi Manusia*." The objective is to categorize the implicit compliments based on their types, analyze the procedures employed in translating implicit compliments in the subtitles of "*Bumi Manusia*," and identify the challenges translators face when translating these implicit compliments. The "*Bumi Manusia*" was chosen as the object of study because of its rich depiction of Indonesian cultural and linguistic elements. An adaptation of Pramoedya Ananta Toer's famous novel, the movie embodies the high-context communication that is a hallmark of Indonesian culture. These qualities make it an ideal source for examining how implicit compliments, as a subtle form of communication, are preserved or adapted in translation.

The data for this study is collected by watching the movie "*Bumi Manusia*" on Netflix, observing both the original Indonesian dialogue and the English subtitles. The researchers focused on identifying utterances that contained implicit compliments. All relevant dialogues containing implicit compliments were transcribed and categorized into the source and target languages.

The data source for this research is the subtitles of the movie "*Bumi Manusia*." As this is a qualitative study, the researchers acted as the primary instrument, or human instrument, in collecting and analyzing the data. To ensure the accurate transcription of the implicit compliments in both Indonesian and English, the researchers watched the movie multiple times. This method enabled the researchers to focus on cultural elements, contextual aspects, and translation techniques applied to implicit compliments. Several measures were taken to ensure the reliability of the data. Independent validation was carried out by involving a second researcher to cross-check the implicit compliments identified and their translations, and iterative checks ensured that the analysis remained within the framework of the study.

The data analysis is conducted in a series of stages. First, the researchers categorized the implicit compliments found in the subtitles in accordance with the framework proposed

by Boyle (2000), which was chosen for its suitability in analyzing implicit compliments. This framework distinguishes between two principal categories of implicit compliments: Firstly, implicit compliments referring to achievements. Secondly, implicit compliments involving comparison are considered. The latter category has been further subdivided to facilitate comprehension of the context in which implicit compliments are given using Holmes' (1986) compliment strategies theory: Appearance, skill or ability, and personality. Subsequently, the translation procedures employed by the translator are analyzed using Newmark' (1988) translation procedures theory, which provides a comprehensive approach to understanding how meaning and cultural nuances are conveyed across languages. This framework includes translation procedures such as transference, cultural equivalent, transposition, and modulation. Finally, the researchers examined potential difficulties faced by translators when dealing with implicit compliments.

4. Results and Discussion

Through an in-depth analysis of the implicit compliments found in the subtitle translations of *"Bumi Manusia."* In this section, the researchers present the findings and discussion of the implicit compliments. Based on the finding, it was found 28 utterances containing implicit compliments throughout the three-hour span of the movie. In accordance with Boyle (2000), the researchers have classified these implicit compliments into two categories: referring to achievements and involving comparison. The latter category has been further subdivided to facilitate comprehension of the context in which implicit compliments are given using Holmes (1986) compliment strategies theory: Appearance, skill or ability, and personality. Furthermore, the researchers found that the translators used several translation procedures as proposed by Newmark (1988) in translating those utterances, including: Transference, cultural equivalent, transposition, and modulation. Table 1 below shows the collected data of the implicit compliments in *"Bumi Manusia."*

Implicit Compliment Types	SL Excerpts (Indonesian Spoken Dialogues and Subtitles)	TL Excerpts (English Subtitles)	Translation Procedures
Refferring to Achievements:			
1. Appearance	<p>Datum 1: <i>Heran kamu melihat <u>mama berdiri tegak seperti Perempuan Eropa?</u></i></p> <p>Datum 2: <i>Kereta kencana ini akan membawamu memuja <u>gadis impian pemuda.</u> Dan aku menyantap daging sapi jantan muda.</i></p>	<p>Datum 1: Surprised to see <u>my mama stand up straight like a European woman?</u></p> <p>Datum 2: This golden chariot will carry you to court <u>the girl of your dreams,</u> and me to eat veal. Cool, right?</p>	<p>Transposition</p> <p>Modulation</p>
2. Skill or Ability	<p>Datum 3: <i><u>Dari kecerdasan Sinyo tampaknya Sinyo tidak hanya tertarik pada sejarah.</u></i></p>	<p>Datum 3: <u>From your intellect, it seems history is not the only thing you're interested in, sinyo.</u></p>	Transference

	<p>Datum 4: <i>Tidak. Ini tulisan tentang kehidupan di Hindia. <u>Jarang sekali ada yang menulis ini.</u> Kau tahu nama aslinya?</i></p> <p>Datum 5: <i>Jadi, Max Tollenaar adalah murid di kelas ini? <u>Bagus! Pribumi atau bukan, bukan ukuran. Tulisan-pemikiran bagus adalah tulisan-pemikiran yang bagus.</u> Lagi pula, bisa kita pelajari.</i></p> <p>Datum 6: <i><u>Aku percaya kamu bisa bikin nama Minke jadi bagus.</u></i></p> <p>Datum 7: <i>Kau mengadu antara hukum Eropa dengan hukum Islam. <u>Itu sangat berani.</u></i></p> <p>Datum 8: <i>Es krim ini penemuan terbesar abad ini, Minke! <u>Manusia ternyata tak hanya bisa mengubah kapal kayu jadi uap. Tapi juga membawa hawa dingin Eropa ke daerah tropis.</u></i></p> <p>Datum 9: <i>Iya. Seratus delapan puluh hektar. Dengan 500 pekerja. <u>Semuanya mama yang kelola. Termasuk masalah keuangan dan segala urusan di bank.</u></i></p> <p>Datum 10: <i><u>Jadi Mama belajar semua ini sendiri?</u></i></p>	<p>Datum 4: No. I found an article about life in the Indies. <u>That is rare.</u> You know what's his real name is?</p> <p>Datum 5: So, Max Tollenaar is a student in this class? <u>That's great! Native or not, that doesn't matter. Good writing and ideas are good writing and ideas.</u> In fact, we can learn from it.</p> <p>Datum 6: <u>I believe you will make the name Minke wonderful.</u></p> <p>Datum 7: You're pitting European law against Islamic law. <u>This is a gutsy move.</u></p> <p>Datum 8: This ice cream is the greatest invention, Minke! <u>The human brain can not only transform the wooden ship into the steamboat, it can bring cold air to tropical lands.</u></p> <p>Datum 9: Yes. All 180 hectares of them, with 500 workers. <u>Mama manages all of them, including the finances and all banking matters.</u></p> <p>Datum 10: <u>So, you learned all this on your own?</u></p>	<p>Modulation</p> <p>Transposition</p> <p>Modulation</p> <p>Modulation</p> <p>Modulation</p> <p>Transposition</p> <p>Modulation</p>
3. Personality	<p>Datum 11: <i><u>Aku pikir orang sini cuma tahu tentang kincir angin Delft Blue.</u></i></p>	<p>Datum 11: <u>I thought people here were only familiar with the delft blue windmill.</u></p>	<p>Transference</p>

	<p>Datum 12: <u>Apalagi yang kau pahami? Sam Pek Eng Tay? Legenda Putri Chang E Huang Zu?</u></p> <p>Datum 13: <u>Tapi, Nyai Ontosoroh dia benar-benar membuat pemikiran modernku berhenti berputar.</u></p> <p>Datum 14: <u>Kamu adalah jawaban kegelisahan ayah atas kondisi masyarakat pribumi.</u></p> <p>Datum 15: <u>Berbahagia dia yang makan hasil keringatnya sendiri.</u></p> <p>Datum 16: <u>Annelies terlahir dari tempaan tekanan bertubi-tubi. Tetapi itu justru yang membuatnya menjadi kekuatan untuknya, pesona untuknya.</u></p> <p>Datum 17: <u>Saya adalah saksi dari cinta dua insan yang teramat indah yang hanya bisa tumbuh setelah badai besar melanda.</u></p> <p>Datum 18: <u>Kita telah melawan sebaik-baiknya, se hormat-hormatnya.</u></p>	<p>Datum 12: <u>What else are you familiar with? Sam Pek Eng Tay? The Legend of Princess Chang'e?</u></p> <p>Datum 13: <u>But, Nyai Ontosoroh she really makes my modern mind stop working.</u></p> <p>Datum 14: <u>You are the answer to my father's restlessness over the natives' conditions.</u></p> <p>Datum 15: <u>Happy is he who eats from the fruit of his own labor.</u></p> <p>Datum 16: <u>Annelies was born among relentless pressure and stress. But they only fuelled her strength and charm.</u></p> <p>Datum 17: <u>I have been lucky to be a witness of a very beautiful love that grew after a huge storm.</u></p> <p>Datum 18: <u>We have fought the best way we can in the most honorable way.</u></p>	<p>Modulation</p> <p>Modulation</p> <p>Transposition</p> <p>Modulation</p> <p>Modulation</p> <p>Transposition</p> <p>Transposition</p>
Involving Comparison			
1. Appearance	<p>Datum 19: <u>Hidung belang lokal. Payah. Yang ini ada di Wonokromo. Gadis Indo. Lebih nyata dari gadis di fotomu.</u></p>	<p>Datum 19: <u>You local playboy. You're so lame. This one is in Wonokromo. She's of mixed-race. More beautiful than the girl in your treasured photo.</u></p>	Cultural Equivalent

	<p>Datum 20: <u>Tak sangka, bisa berhadapan dengan dewi secantik ini.</u></p> <p>Datum 21: <u>Ini dipakai dulu, biar tidak gosong. Nanti tak cantik lagi! Kalah dariku.</u></p> <p>Datum 22: <u>Kasihannya Perempuan-perempuan Belanda itu, Ann. Malu mereka atas kecantikannya.</u></p> <p>Datum 23: <u>Pada suatu hari ada seorang gadis, cantik, secantik dewi.</u></p>	<p>Datum 20: <u>I wasn't expecting to meet a beautiful goddess like you.</u></p> <p>Datum 21: <u>Please wear this so you won't get sunburnt. Else you won't be as beautiful. You'll lose to me.</u></p> <p>Datum 22: <u>I feel bad for the Dutch women. They all feel inferior because of your beauty.</u></p> <p>Datum 23: <u>Once upon a time there was a girl, as beautiful as a goddess.</u></p>	<p>Modulation</p> <p>Modulation</p> <p>Modulation</p> <p>Transposition</p>
2. Skill or Ability	<p>Datum 24: <u>Dari mana mamamu mempelajari semua ini? Dia lulusan mana?</u></p> <p>Datum 25: <u>Mereka yang memulai menabuh gamelan. Tapi gongnya ada di kamu.</u></p> <p>Datum 26: <u>Seperti gong dalam gamelan. Ketika dipukul, seluruh irama gamelan berhenti. Kau akan jadi gong itu, Minke.</u></p>	<p>Datum 24: <u>Where did your Mama learn all of this? What school did she go to?</u></p> <p>Datum 25: <u>They are the ones who beat the gamelan. But the gong is in your hand.</u></p> <p>Datum 26: <u>Just like a gong among the gamelan. All the rhythm stops when you hit it. You will be that gong, Minke.</u></p>	<p>Transposition</p> <p>Transposition</p> <p>Transposition</p>
3. Personality	<p>Datum 27: <u>Tapi setangkai Tulip lebih mahal dari serumpun Mawar.</u></p> <p>Datum 28: <u>Jawa tapi berpikiran modern adalah jawaban atas negerimu.</u></p>	<p>Datum 27: <u>But the stem of a tulip is still worth more than a bunch of roses.</u></p> <p>Datum 28: <u>A Javanese man with a modern way of thinking will be a way out for your nation.</u></p>	<p>Transposition</p> <p>Modulation</p>

Table 1. The Data of Implicit Compliments in "Bumi Manusia"

4.1 Implicit Compliment Types

The finding illustrates the presence of 28 utterances containing implicit compliments. In accordance with Boyle (2000), the data shows 18 utterances are implicit compliments referring to achievements and the remainder are implicit compliment involving comparison. The latter category has been further subdivided to facilitate comprehension of the context in which implicit compliments are given.

Firstly, implicit compliments referring to achievements are compliments that are delivered implicitly through the individual's achievements and accomplishments. As such, the compliment is not expressed explicitly; rather, it is referred through the achievements that the person has made. For instance, one may not directly state that someone is intelligent or talented, but they may refer to successes in education, work, or other activities that reflect the individual's personality, ability and dedication. Datum 15 is one of the examples of personality topics concept:

SL:	TL
Nyai Ontosoroh: <i>Usaha apa, Nyo?</i>	Nyai Ontosoroh: What line of business, nyo?
Minke: <i>Mebel. Dari kelas teratas, Ma. Mungkin Mama sering lihat di Kerajaan Inggris, Austria, Prancis. Dari mulai Renaissance, Baroque, Rococo, sampai Victoria saya ada. Dan biasanya saya tawarkan di kapal. Untuk orang tua teman-teman sekolah saya.</i>	Minke: Furniture. Of the highest class, Ma. You might have often seen them in England, Austria, and France. I have everything from Renaissance, Baroque, Rococo, to Victorian. I usually travel on ships to sell them, to my schoolmates' parents.
Minke: <u><i>Berbahagiaalah dia yang makan hasil keringatnya sendiri.</i></u>	Nyai Ontosoroh: <u>Happy is he who eats from the fruit of his own labor.</u>

Table 2. Excerpt of Datum 15

In the excerpt, Nyai Ontosoroh's statement. "*Berbahagiaalah dia yang makan hasil keringatnya sendiri.* (Happy is he who eats from the fruit of his own labor)", functions as an implicit compliment to Minke, who has worked diligently in the furniture business. Although she does not mention Minke by name, Nyai Ontosoroh acknowledges Minke's dedication and hard work in achieving success, and emphasises the value of independence. This expression demonstrates appreciation for Minke's achievements and illustrates that the results of one's own efforts are honourable.

Secondly, the term "implicit compliments involving comparison" is used to describe compliments that are conveyed indirectly through the use of comparison. In this form, the compliment is not delivered directly, but is embedded within an expression or statement that compares a person with someone else highlighting their distinctive qualities and abilities that are not commonly found in others (in the context of the movie). This type of compliment can reinforce a positive impression in a subtle and effective manner, particularly in a cultural context that values modesty or humility, as is the case in Indonesia. Datum 26 is one of the examples of skill or ability topic concept:

SL:	TL:
<p>Miriam (Bahasa Belanda): <i>Minke. Sejak pertemuan kita di rumah ayah menyatakan kekaguman atas kecerdasanmu. Begitu pun aku dan Sarah. Kamu adalah jawaban kegelisahan ayah atas kondisi masyarakat pribumi. Jawa tapi berpikiran modern adalah jawaban atas negerimu. Seperti gong dalam gamelan. Ketika dipukul, seluruh irama gamelan berhenti. <u>Kau akan jadi gong itu, Minke.</u></i></p>	<p>Miriam (in Dutch): Ever since our encounter at my home, Dad has stated his admiration for your intelligence. As have I and Sarah. You are the answer to my father's restlessness over the natives' conditions. A Javanese man with a modern way of thinking will be a way out for your nation. Just like a gong among the gamelan. All the rhythm stops when you hit it. <u>You will be that gong, Minke.</u></p>

Table 3. Excerpt of Datum 26

From the excerpt, Miriam associates Minke with the gong in the gamelan to convey implicit compliment for his intelligence and potential as an influential figure. Miriam states that she, Sarah, and her father are impressed by Minke's modern thinking, which addresses her father's concerns about the condition of the indigenous people. Miriam's assertion that "*Jawa tapi berpikiran modern adalah jawaban atas negerimu.* (A Javanese man with a modern way of thinking will be a way out for your nation)" indicates her belief that Minke, despite his indigenous background, possesses the capacity to effect change within his nation. The gong analogy used emphasizes that, just as the gong is able to stop the entire rhythm of the gamelan when struck, Minke also has the ability and important role to influence society.

This study's result is the same as the study of compliment strategies in a movie entitled "The Spectacular Now," conducted by Arimbi (2021). This study reveals that the topics of skill or ability are the most commonly used, followed by the topics of personality and appearance. This indicates that implicit compliments are more likely to recognize an individual's abilities and character than their physical appearance. These findings extend Arimbi's (2021) study by shifting the focus from explicit to implicit compliments, thereby deepening the analysis of compliment strategies. Using Boyle (2000) classification, this study classifies implicit compliments to highlight how implicit compliments can be employed to acknowledge achievements or establish admiration through comparison. This, in turn, provides insight into the cultural nuances in the expression of compliments.

4.2 Translation Procedures

This study aims to analyze the procedures used in the translation of implicit compliments. The translation procedures are utilized for the translation of sentences and smaller language units, which is appropriate rather than the translation methods to analyze the forms of implicit compliments in the text (subtitles), as this allows for a flexible approach in capturing the nuances of implicit compliments according to the cultural and communication context in which they are expressed. Based on the findings, translators use 4 procedures proposed by Newmark (1988), of which modulation is the most used, followed by transposition, transference, and cultural equivalent.

According to Newmark (1988), modulation is a translation procedure in which a translator attempts to reproduce the message of the SL in the TL while adhering to the prevailing TL norms. This is especially important given that the SL and the TL may appear from different perspectives. Essentially, modulation can be defined as a shift in perspective.

Datum 8:

SL: *Manusia ternyata tak hanya bisa mengubah kapal kayu jadi uap. Tapi juga membawa hawa dingin Eropa ke daerah tropis.*

TL: The human brain can not only transform the wooden ship into the steamboat, it can bring cold air to tropical lands.

The translators shift a general term, “*manusia* (humans),” to a specific term, “the human brain,” and the word, “*Eropa* (Europe)” is not translated in the TL to make the subtitle clearer and more concise.

Besides the modulation, transposition is a common occurrence in translation. This is due the fact that each language has distinct set of grammatical rules.

Datum 18:

SL: *Kita telah melawan sebaik-baiknya, se hormat-hormatnya.*

TL: We have fought the best way we can in the most honorable way.

As it can be seen in the SL, the structure uses repetition and emphasis through the use of “*sebaik-baiknya, se hormat-hormatnya*,” wherein the modifier follows the main action (*melawan*). In the TL, this phrase is translated to “the best way we can in the most honorable way,” with the modifiers are more explicitly expressed before the main idea to align with English sentence structure. This procedure effectively preserves the SL meaning without distorting the message in the TL by ensuring clarity and maintaining the intended tone that suits the English style.

Furthermore, another procedure is transference or borrowing, whereby a SL word is reproduced in the TL without alteration to form or meaning. This approach enables translators to preserve the original cultural significance and context of the term, thereby facilitating a richer understanding of the SL culture for the TL audience, particularly in instances where no equivalent term exists in the TL.

Datum 3:

SL: *Dari kecerdasan Sinyo tampaknya Sinyo tidak hanya tertarik pada sejarah.*

TL: From your intellect, it seems history is not the only thing you’re interested in, sinyo.

The term “*Sinyo*” is directly transferred from the SL to the TL, as there is no exact equivalent in English. According to *KBBI* “*Sinyo*” is the unmarried son of a European or European *peranakan* during the Dutch colonial period. Similarly, although not specifically included in this procedure, the term “*Nyai*” serves as an example (“*Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia (KBBI)*,” 2016). According to Berg (2010), “*Nyai*” is a nickname for an indigenous woman, who may also be Chinese or Japanese, who lives with European, Chinese, or Arab men without marriage relationships. Borrowing in this way enriches the TL by incorporating unique cultural elements, especially for expressions, names, or titles with deep cultural connotations, allowing the TL audience to gain insight into the SL culture and its historical context.

The final procedure is a cultural equivalent. This is an approximate translation in which a SL cultural word is translated by a TL cultural word (Newmark, 1988).

Datum 19:

SL: *Hidung belang lokal. Payah. Yang ini ada di Wonokromo. Gadis Indo. Lebih nyata dari gadis di fotomu.*

TL: You local playboy. You're so lame. This one is in Wonokromo. She's of mixed-race. More beautiful than the girl in your treasured photo.

The term “*Indo*” is used to describe the child of an indigenous woman (*Nyai*) and a European man Hera & Wijaya, 2014). Therefore, based on the excerpt above, “*gadis Indo*” can be translated as a “mixed-race,” which conveys a similar cultural understanding in the TL context. By using the term “mixed-race,” the translators effectively communicate the cultural nuance of the SL term while making it accessible to the TL audience, who may not be familiar with the specific historical context of “*Indo*.”

The result of the translation procedures used in translating implicit compliments in subtitles is in accordance with the findings of previous research conducted by Afandi and Authar (2021); Saputra et al. (2022); Sudarto et al. (2020). These studies also identified modulation, transference, and transposition as key translation strategies employed in subtitles. However, this study builds on these insights by including the cultural equivalent as an additional translation procedure that supports the analysis of implicit compliments in “*Bumi Manusia*.” By adopting this combination of procedures, this study provides a comprehensive view of how implicit compliments can be effectively conveyed across languages, considering cultural nuances and enhancing the readability and relatability of the TL for an international audience.

4.3 The Possible Challenges

The translation of implicit compliments from “*Bumi Manusia*” into English have the possibility to presents a number of complex challenges, primarily due to the existence of differences in cultural communication styles and language structures. These challenges have the potential to significantly impact the manner in which implicit compliments are conveyed in the target language, thereby affecting their intended meaning.

Traditions, cultures, beliefs, thoughts, or ideas can be preserved and protected when it is widely accepted and recognized by the international community (Zhang, 2014). The Indonesian cultural context is characterized by a strong emphasis on indirect communication, with the use of subtle compliments that reflect the language’s high-context nature. This reliance on context results in implicit compliments being frequently conveyed through allusions or comparisons, as opposed to direct statements. To illustrate, in Datum 26, Miriam compares Minke’s potential impact to a “*gong* among the *gamelan*.” In Javanese culture, the *gong* is a significant symbol, representing leadership and influence. The phrase, “Just like a *gong* among the *gamelan*. All the rhythm stops when you hit it. You will be that *gong*, Minke,” demonstrates admiration for Minke’s potential influence. However, without an understanding of this cultural symbolism, English-speaking audiences may not fully grasp the depth of this implicit compliment. Consequently, translators must therefore navigate

cultural references carefully, such as adjusting or expanding the translation to clarify culturally loaded compliments.

Additionally, structural differences between Indonesian and English create challenges in maintaining the original intent and style of implicit compliments. Indonesian expressions often include repetitions or specific word choices to emphasize particular aspects. However, such stylistic elements may not be directly translatable into English. Datum 18, "*sebaik-baiknya, se hormat-hormatnya,*" translated into "the best way we can in the most honorable way," adjusting the original repetition to fit English syntax which emphasizes effort and respect. However, the English language lacks a direct equivalent for this emphasis, which means that translators must decide whether to use a formal tone or rephrase in order to maintain the original expression, while adapting English grammar. Thus, structural adjustments may be necessary, but there is a risk that they will alter the tone or style intended by the source language.

Furthermore, certain terms in Indonesian carry culturally specific meanings that cannot be directly translated into English without losing their depth. Terms like "*Sinyo*" in Datum 3, used to refer to a young European-descended male during the Dutch colonial period, have no English equivalent. Similarly, the term "*Nyai*," refers to an indigenous woman in a relationship with European man, carrying historical and cultural value. The translators' decision to retain "*Sinyo*" in the English subtitle respects the original term's cultural significance, but it may still be unclear for non-Indonesian audiences. Translators often have to choose between retaining such terms through borrowing, as with "*Sinyo*," or using approximate terms, which may lose some of the cultural richness.

In essence, these challenges underscore the complex process of translating the implicit compliments in "*Bumi Manusia*". The translators had to be adept at handling cultural nuances, indirect communication styles, and differences in language structure, while striving to preserve the original text's authenticity. By overcoming these complexities, they have facilitated the dissemination of Indonesian cultural richness and contextual depth to a broader audience.

5. Conclusion

In conclusion, this study examined the translation of implicit compliments in the subtitles of "*Bumi Manusia*," an Indonesian movie set during the Dutch colonial period. Through the analysis, the study identified two main types of implicit compliments, those referring to achievements and those involving comparisons based on Boyle's (2000) framework. From the 28 data collected, the findings indicate that translators employed several translation procedures proposed by Newmark (1988), such as modulation, transposition, transference, and cultural equivalence to convey the meaning of implicit compliments.

The findings underscore the complexity of translating implicit compliments, particularly when navigating cultural and linguistic differences between high-context languages like Indonesian and low-context languages like English. These challenges highlight the importance of understanding cultural nuances and linguistic structures in order to preserve the subtleties of the original dialogue while ensuring accessibility for target audiences.

The study provides practical insights for translators by highlighting the need to balance cultural authenticity and audience comprehension when translating culturally

embedded expressions. For scholars of cross-cultural pragmatics, the research offers a focused exploration of how implicit compliments can serve as a lens for studying language and cultural transfer in translation. However, a limitation of this study is its focus on single movie, which may limit the generalizability of the findings to other genres or works from different cultural backgrounds. Furthermore, the study does not present a comparison between the analysis from the movie and its novel.

Future research could build upon this by examining implicit compliment translations across a range of genres, including comedies and romance, to ascertain how genre-specific elements influence translation choices and the nuances conveyed. Comparative analyses of the movie and novel versions of the same story could also deepen understanding of how different medium influence translation strategies. Additionally, it would also be valuable to investigate how different audiences interpret translated implicit compliments, which would facilitate a more comprehensive understanding of cross-cultural perception and reception in translation.

References

- Afandi, M. D., & Authar, N. (2021). Analysis of translation techniques in the English subtitle of the movie "Ketika Cinta Bertasbih 1." *EXPOSURE : JURNAL PENDIDIKAN BAHASA INGGRIS*, 10(2), 358–380. <https://doi.org/10.26618/exposure.v10i2.6105>
- Arimbi, R. (2021). The analysis of compliment strategies in a movie entitled The Spectacular Now. *Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra, Dan Studi Amerika*, 27(2). <https://doi.org/10.20961/jbssa.v27i2.44399>
- Bb Hera, Fx. D., & Wijaya, D. N. (2014). Terasing dalam budaya barat dan timur: Potret "Nyai" Hindia Belanda, abad XVII-XX. *Jurnal Antropologi: Isu-Isu Sosial Budaya*, 16(1), 49. <https://doi.org/10.25077/jantro.v16.n1.p49-56.2014>
- Berg, L. W. C. van den. (2010). *Orang Arab di Nusantara*. Komunitas Bambu.
- Boyle, R. (2000). "You've worked with Elizabeth Taylor!": Phatic functions and implicit. *Applied Linguistics*, 21(1), 26–46. <https://doi.org/10.1093/applin/21.1.26>
- Bruti, S. (2006). Cross-cultural pragmatics: The translation of implicit compliments in subtitles. *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, (6), 185–197.
- Chai, W., Ong, H. Y., Amini, M., & Ravindran, L. (2022). The art of paper cutting: Strategies and challenges in Chinese to English subtitle translation of cultural items. *Journal of Modern Languages*, 32(1), 84–103. <https://doi.org/10.22452/jml.vol32no1.5>
- Collins, J. T. (2019). Global eras and language diversity in Indonesia: Transdisciplinary projects towards language maintenance and revitalization. *Paradigma: Jurnal Kajian Budaya*, 9(2), 103–117. <https://doi.org/10.17510/paradigma.v9i2.302>
- Dayter, D., Locher, M. A., & Messerli, T. C. (2023). *Pragmatics in translation: Mediality, participation and relational work* (1st ed.). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/9781009261210>
- Fristando, C. A. (2022). Politeness strategies in giving and responding to compliments by all characters in the movies entitled "Fundamentals of Caring" and "Wonder". *Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra, Dan Studi Amerika*, 28(1), 1–9. <https://doi.org/10.20961/jbssa.v28i1.39518>
- Hall, E. T. (1976). *Beyond culture*. Bantam Doubleday Dell Publishing Group.

- Holmes, J. (1986). Compliments and compliment responses in New Zealand English. *Anthropological Linguistics*, 28(4), 485–508.
- Holmes, J. (1988). Paying compliments: A sex-preferential politeness strategy. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 12(4), 445–465. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0378-2166\(88\)90005-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/0378-2166(88)90005-7)
- Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia (KBBI). (2016). Retrieved from <https://kbbi.kemdikbud.go.id/entri/sinyo>
- Kreidler, C. (2002). *Introducing English semantics*. Taylor & Francis e-Library.
- Levinson, S. C. (2003). *Pragmatics*. Cambridge University Press.
- Muji Agustiyani. (2020). Compliment Strategies Used by The Judges in Indonesian and American Idol 2019: A Cross-Cultural Pragmatics Study. *Script Journal: Journal of Linguistics and English Teaching*, 5(2), 55–69. <https://doi.org/10.24903/sj.v5i2.492>
- Newmark, P. (1988). *A textbook of translation*. Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press.
- Putri, L. (2023). An Analysis of Compliment Expression Found in the Movie Entitled Afterlife of the Party. *Jurnal Sains Sosio Humaniora*, 7(2), 175–183. <https://doi.org/10.22437/jssh.v7i2.16420>
- Renna, D. (2023). Exploring (un)translatability in pragmatics: Chinese and English forms of address in subtitles. *Intercultural Pragmatics*, 20(3), 297–321. <https://doi.org/10.1515/ip-2023-3005>
- Saputra, N., Sulistyani, S., Fatmawati, E., & Herman, H. (2022). Translation techniques of subtitle from english into indonesian in a movie: A case on literature. *ScienceRise*, (2), 30–36. <https://doi.org/10.21303/2313-8416.2022.002422>
- Saragih, W. R., & Manullang, E. B. (2023). The subtitle strategy of cultural translation in “Murder on The Orient Express” movie. *TRANSFORM : Journal of English Language Teaching and Learning*, 11(3), 173. <https://doi.org/10.24114/tj.v11i3.44035>
- Stadler, S. (2018). Cross-cultural pragmatics. In C. A. Chapelle (Ed.), *The Encyclopedia of Applied Linguistics* (1st ed., pp. 1–8). Wiley. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781405198431.wbeal0289.pub2>
- Sudarto, Y. D., Suhartono, S., & Mintowati, M. (2020). Cultural adjustments in translation of English to Indonesian in National Geographic. *RETORIKA: Jurnal Bahasa, Sastra, Dan Pengajarannya*, 13(1), 97. <https://doi.org/10.26858/retorika.v13i1.11892>
- Susini, M. (2020). Overcoming implicit meaning in Indonesian-English translation. *RETORIKA: Jurnal Ilmu Bahasa*, 6(1), 63–68. <https://doi.org/10.22225/jr.6.1.1646.63-68>
- Widyanita, C. Y., & Pasaribu, T. A. (2019). Compliments by male and female characters in Me Before You movie. *Academic Journal Perspective : Education, Language, and Literature*, 7(2), 84–90. <https://doi.org/10.33603/perspective.v7i2.2785>
- Wu, L. (2008). *Gender-based different in compliments: In the American comedy TV-series Ugly Betty* (Kristianstad University). Kristianstad University. Retrieved from <https://www.diva-portal.org/smash/record.jsf?pid=diva2%3A224605&dswid=-1203>
- Wulansari. (2019). Direct and indirect compliment responses: A descriptive qualitative study among Indonesians and Americans. *English Teaching Journal : A Journal of English Literature, Language and Education*, 7(1), 9. <https://doi.org/10.25273/etj.v7i1.4544>
- Zhang, C. (2014). *Diverse demands—Theme strategies of Chinese documentary with intercultural communication*. 694–697. Zhengzhou, Henan, China. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icelaic-14.2014.175>