

INDONESIAN TO ENGLISH SINGABLE TRANSLATIONS BY LOCAL AND FOREIGN TRANSLATORS

Gloria Christine Setiyowati, Andika Wijaya

Universitas Indonesia (UI), Depok, Indonesia

E-mail: gloriachristines@gmail.com, andika.wijaya@ui.ac.id

Received: 24 October 2020

Accepted: 04 December 2020

Abstract

Song lyric translation is important because in these recent decades people can access songs worldwide. The aim of this research is to gain an understanding of the difference between singable translations made by an Indonesian translator and a foreign translator by investigating what translation procedures and methods occur in two translated songs from Indonesian to English using qualitative descriptive method. The result of this research indicates that the singable translation made by a foreign translator is more identical to the source language (SL) compared to the one made by an Indonesian translator. However, despite the differences, the two translated songs share something in common, for instance the singability and the length of lyrics. Taking the findings into consideration, it could be said that the foreign translator is more faithful to the source text (ST), while the Indonesian translator emphasizes the target language (TL) more.

Keywords: singable translation, procedures, methods, source text, target text.

1. Introduction

Song is one of the most important kinds of entertainment in human life. In general, song is written and also sung only in one language. However, there are also songs which are translated from one language to another language for several reasons. Some may just transfer a song to another language in order to understand the meaning of the lyrics, while some others may translate it to be sung in another language. This research discusses the second purpose of song translation, which is singable translation, or a translation of a song which later can be performed by a musician. This is certainly not an easy task for the translators because they need to make a translation that sounds as if it has been made for the music (Low, 2005). Therefore, a skilled song translator is thus a combination of someone who is competent in linguistics and also in music.

According to Sebnem (2008), music is such a big part of our everyday life. Despite its significance in human life, however, song lyric translations have not been an explored field within translation studies until quite recently. Some studies have been done to analyze song lyric translations from one language to another language using the translation strategies (Åkerström, 2009), techniques (Anggasta and Pattinasarany, 2013), methods (Mazni, Murni, and Pohan, 2018), and approximation theories (Laurer, 2019), but not many have compared the translation made by a foreigner and a native of the source language (SL), particularly Indonesian.

This research focuses on the translations of two Indonesian songs as the source texts (ST) to English as the target texts (TT) by Christian Bautista and NIDJI, namely “Till the End of Time” and “Lights of Love”. Both songs have been chosen as they have perfectly portrayed how differently Indonesian songs are translated by a foreign translator and an Indonesian translator. The aim of this research is to compare the translation made by a foreign translator and an Indonesian translator by looking at the singable translations. The specific research questions concern translation methods and strategies used in the translation of the two songs above, for these procedures and methods are very important to make such a good translation that fits the original melody of the song. In order to analyze those songs, theories about translation methods (Newmark, 1988) and procedures (Vinay and Darbelnet, 2015) are used.

2. Literature Review

These following studies have analyzed the use of paraphrasing in song lyrics translations. Åkerström (2009) in her study has examined three translated song lyrics from Sweden to English. In another study, Anggasta and Pattinasarany (2013) have investigated the translation of English popular songs to German. On the other hand, Laurer (2019) has analyzed popular German songs and its translation in English. The results from these studies show that there are a lot of paraphrasing used in the target language (TL) translation in order to deliver the meaning smoothly from the SL.

Unlike the previous studies, the study from Mazni, Murni, and Pohan (2018) have investigated the errors made by tenth grade students in Tanjung Pinang when translating song lyrics from Indonesian to English. The kinds of errors in this study are analyzed using the theory of errors in translation, which is divided into five categories; inversion, addition, omission, modification, and deviation. Mazni, Murni, and Pohan have also used a similar theory to this research, which is the method of translation theory by Newmark (1988). The results of their study show that the subjects still made all kinds of errors in translating song lyrics, and most errors that the students made were the errors of deviation which accounted for 119 errors.

Another study about translation has been done by Chen (2020). In his study, Chen has found that translation made by a professional translator and translation made by the original author bring different results. While the result of translation that was made by a professional translator is close to the original text, the self-translated text provides a freer result in terms of meaning.

It can be seen that previous studies have started the study on song translations, however, none of them has analyzed Indonesian songs that are translated to English by a foreign and an Indonesian translator. This research discusses it further by looking at the procedures and methods used by each translator. By using different procedures and methods, of course the meaning delivered in the song translations could be different. Thus, it is important to understand the procedures and methods used by a foreign translator and an Indonesian translator.

Two songs that are originally written in Indonesian are used as the corpora. The first song “*Hingga Akhir Waktu*” is translated to “Till the End of Time” by the singer Christian Bautista as a foreign translator and the second song titled “*Bila Aku Jatuh Cinta*” and its translation “Lights of Love” have both been originally written and translated by the Indonesian band Nidji. This research investigates how singable translation from Indonesian

to English made by a foreign and an Indonesian translator are different. Through the analysis, the translation procedures and methods used are figured out. Then this paper elaborates how these differences affect the meaning of the translated songs.

Translation according to Hatim and Munday (2004) is a phenomenon that has a huge effect on everyday life. Translation itself is a practice of rendering one language to another that has been a very important service since ancient times (Chen, 2020). Back then, the translation was only used for written materials, like novels, stories, and newspapers. However, in recent decades another form of translation has emerged, which is audiovisual translation. As Matkivska (2014) has said, audiovisual translation refers to the translation of cinematographical products. Some examples of audiovisual translation are television script, games, and song lyrics.

This research focuses on singable song lyric translation. As Low (2017) has stated, songs are really close and important in human culture. Therefore, there are some reasons why people translate song lyrics. The most common answers are: 1. to understand the lyrics, and 2. to sing the song in a different language. If it is the first reason, then the translation process is just similar to other forms of translation sources (text). However, some songs are translated to be sung in another language. As Desblache (2019) has said, the translation of song lyrics can make those songs more meaningful musically, linguistically, and culturally to the audience in the TL. When doing so, the translator needs to pay attention not only to the linguistic aspects but also to the musicality aspects in order to make a good singable translation.

A singable translation, according to Low (2008), is intended for performance, thus the translator usually pays extra attention to the rhyme that has to be the same as the source language. However, Low (2008) has also explained that there are four other aspects that need to be considered to create a good singable translation in addition to rhyme, which are sense, naturalness, rhythm, and singability. Therefore, the translator is flexible to use the strategy in finding the right words in its TL because an exact equivalent is always impossible (Desblache, 2019). A good song translator is not only a linguist but also a poet and a musician as well (Low, 2008). Other aspects that form a good singable translation are the translation procedures and methods used.

Vinay and Darbelnet (1995) have suggested two translation procedures: direct translation procedures (borrowing, calque, and literal) and oblique translation procedures (transposition, modulation). Direct translation procedures are often used to overcome the gaps between the SL and TL by transposing the message piece by piece from SL to TL (Walinski, 2015). The first procedure, borrowing, is relatively the simplest of all procedures used for translation. It involves the use of foreign phrases in the target text. Next, calque is a special kind of borrowing in which the TL borrows an expression from the SL by translating literally each of the original elements. Literal translation, or word for word translation, is a translation procedure which translates each word in the SL to the exact same word in the TL. Using this procedure, the translator focuses predominantly on adhering to the linguistic rules of the SL.

In some cases, for example when there is no natural equivalent found in the TL, some more complex procedures are needed to convey the meaning of the SL. Thus, oblique translation procedures can be used. The first oblique translation procedure is transposition. Transposition involves replacing one-word class with another without changing the meaning of the text. Transposition consists of five shifts. The first one is a level shift. It is a shift from

lexical expression to grammatical expression. Next is a structure shift, which is a shift in the order of the structure. Then there is a class shift that occurs when the translation equivalent of a SL item is a member of a different class in the TL. Also there is a unit-shift. The last one is an intra-system shift that occurs internally or within the language system. One example can be seen in Indonesian and English pronouns of a person. English has he and she (gender based) pronouns where Indonesian only has *dia* for both male and female. For this reason, it can be said that Indonesian has a neutral pronoun. The second oblique translation procedure is modulation. Modulation involves changing the form of the message through a change in perspective. An alteration of this kind may be required in contexts where a literal or transposed translation still sounds awkward in the TL, despite being grammatically correct utterance. There are two kinds of modulation. The first one is a different point of view and the last one is a different scope that sees the SL from a wide to narrow meaning or vice versa.

Later, Vinay and Darbelnet's (1995) translation procedures are used to deal with incompatibilities between SL and TL structures and distinguish two major methods of translation. Newmark (1998) has said that in translating a text, there are two methods approaches that can be used. The first one is the SL emphasis, and the other one would be the TL emphasis. The two approaches are broken down into more details. SL emphasis methods consist of word-for-word, literal, faithful, and semantic translation.

3. Research Method

This research primarily uses qualitative descriptive methods. These descriptive methods analyzed data by using various strategies. In this research, the data or corpora were organized in their original order to provide a clear explanation.

The corpora used in this research were the song lyrics of two Indonesian songs and its English singable translations made by a foreign translator and an Indonesian translator. The first Indonesian song "*Hingga Akhir Waktu*" was translated to "Till the End of Time" by a Filipino singer Christian Bautista. Meanwhile, the second song "*Bila Aku Jatuh Cinta*" was translated into "Lights of Love" by its original singer, Nidji group band. These songs and their translations were carefully chosen since both represented how differently a foreigner and an Indonesian translator created a singable English translation from Indonesian songs.

The lyrics of the songs were put in a table of three columns. The first column consisted of the SL of the song, which was Indonesian. The next column represented the TL of the songs that were made by each translator. Then the third column showed the literal meaning of the original lyrics in English. All three lyrics were aligned side by side in a table in order to see clearly how they were translated. The translation methods and procedures were noted and later used to compare the translation methods and procedures which were used by both translators to see if any interesting differences could be found. Afterwards, the results of the analysis were presented.

4. Results and Discussion

The analysis of the two songs has been carried out individually. The song lyrics and their singable translations are first presented side by side along with the literal meaning of the original lyrics as a comparison. Then it is followed by tables of the translation methods and procedures that can be found in each song. The words or phrases in bold are the ones that meet the translation methods or procedures. Below each table, the complete explanations

on the translation methods and procedures are provided. The first analysis is about an Indonesian song to its English translated version made by a foreign translator with the title “*Hingga Akhir Waktu*” and “*Till the End of Time*”.

1. Song 1 “*Hingga Akhir Waktu*”

Table 1. Translation of Song 1 “*Hingga Akhir Waktu*”

ST	TT	ST's Literal Meaning
<i>“Hingga Akhir Waktu”</i>	<i>“Till the End of Time”</i>	<i>“Until the End of Time”</i>
<i>Kucoba untuk melawan hati Tapi hampa terasa di sini tanpamu Bagiku semua sangat berarti lagi Kuingin kau di sini tepiskan sepiku Bersamamu</i>	I try to resist what my heart feels But I'm falling into pieces Drifting further away from you Everything won't seem right If you were here with me You'd brush away this loneliness from me	I try to resist the liver But empty is felt here without you For me everything is very meaningful again I want you here fend off my loneliness With you
<i>Takkan pernah ada yang lain di sisi Segenap jiwa hanya untukmu Dan takkan mungkin ada yang lain di sisi Kuingin kau disini tepiskan sepiku Bersamamu</i>	There will never be another by my side Because all I am is just for you And there can never be another by my side I need you here with me And brush away this loneliness from me	There will never be another by the side The entire soul is just for you And it's never possible that there is another by the side I want you here fend off my loneliness With you
<i>Bagiku semua sangat berarti Kuingin kau di sini Bagiku semua sangat berarti lagi Kuingin kau di sini</i>	Everything was seem so right If you were here with me Everything was seem right, once again I need you here with me	For me everything is very meaningful I want you here For me everything is very meaningful again I want you here
<i>Takkan pernah ada yang lain di sisi Segenap jiwa hanya untukmu Dan takkan mungkin ada yang lain di sisi Kuingin kau di sini tepiskan sepiku Bersamamu</i>	There will never be another by my side Because all I am is just for you And there can never be another by my side I need you here with me You brush away this loneliness from me	There will never be another by the side The entire soul is just for you And it's never possible that there is another by the side I want you here fend off my loneliness With you
<i>Hingga akhir waktu Hingga akhir waktu</i>	'Till the end of time 'Till the end of time	Until the end of time Until the end of time
<i>Takkan pernah ada yang lain di sisi Segenap jiwa hanya untukmu Dan takkan mungkin ada yang lain di sisi Kuingin kau di sini tepiskan sepiku Bersamamu</i>	There will never be another by my side Because all I am is just for you And there can never be another by my side I need you here with me You brush away this loneliness from me	There will never be another by the side The entire soul is just for you And it's never possible that there is another by the side I want you here fend off my loneliness With you

<i>Hingga akhir waktu</i>	'Till the end of time	Until the end of time
<i>Hingga akhir waktu</i>	'Till the end of time	Until the end of time

1.a. Translation Methods

Table 2. Faithful translation methods in song 1

Translation Methods	ST	TT	ST's Literal Meaning
Faithful Translation	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. "Hingga Akhir Waktu" 2. <i>Kucoba untuk melawan hati</i> 3. <i>Takkan pernah ada yang lain di sisi</i> 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. "Till the End of Time" 2. I try to resist what my heart feels 3. There will never be another by my side 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. "Until the End of Time" 2. I try to resist the liver 3. There will never be another by the side

Looking at the entirety of the song and its translation, it can be said that the dominant translation methods occurring in the first song is faithful translation. The translator here was faithful in terms of the meaning and the number of words used in the translation. In every verse or stanza, it is seen that the length of the ST and the TT is quite similar, which shows that the translator does not paraphrase the text. Instead, the translator follows the pattern of the TL and only changes minor parts of the lyrics with the aim of composing a melodic singable translation that has identical rhythm to the original song.

In order to clarify the claim, three examples in the table are explained further. The first example of faithful translation methods can be seen in the title of the song itself. From the TL *"Hingga Akhir Waktu"*, it is translated to *"Till the End of Time"*. In this translation, the TL means exactly the same as the SL; however, the translator abbreviated the word *"until"* into *"till"* in order to make an identical rhythm with the SL. Next, the line *"untuk melawan hati"* is translated to *"to resist what my heart feels"* which can also be translated to *"to resist my heart"*. However, to make the translation equivalent to the original song's music, the translator added more words. Another example is in the phrase *"yang lain di sisi"* which translated to *"be another by my side"*. The translation still means the same as the SL and does not feel awkward in the TL. By that it means that the translator does intend to make the singable translation close to the SL but still melodic to be sung.

1.b. Translation Procedures

1.b.1 Literal translation

Table 3. Literal translation procedures in song 1

Translation Procedures	ST	TT	ST's Literal Meaning
Literal Translation	1. "Hingga Akhir Waktu"	1. "Till the end of time"	1. "Until the End of Time"

In the example above, one translation procedure that is found is a literal translation. As what has been explained in the previous section, literal translation is one of the direct translation procedures that put emphasis on the SL. Literal translation in this finding shows the use of the exact same words and structure in both the original song and translation which can be seen in the title of this song *"Hingga Akhir Waktu"* that is translated to *"Till the end of time"*.

1.b.2 Transposition unit shift

Table 4. Transposition unit-shift in song 1

Translation Procedures	ST	TT	ST's Literal Meaning
Transposition Unit-shift	1. <i>Kucoba untuk melawan hati</i> 2. <i>Kuingin kau di sini tepiskan sepiku bersamamu</i>	1. I try to resist what my heart feels 2. I need you here with me You'd brush away this loneliness from me	1. I try to resist the liver 2. I want you here fend off my loneliness with you

Moving on to transposition, there are two unit-shift examples that are found in this song. The first one is the single word “*hati*” that is translated to a phrase “what my heart feels”. The additional words are needed in order to give a clearer explanation on how the person needs to resist his feelings, not his heart as an organ. Next, the word “*tepiskan*” is shifted to “brush away”. It is seen that the unit of rank in the ST is a word, but then it is translated into a phrase. This is used to make the text in the TL sound natural.

1.b.3 Modulation different point of view

Table 5. Modulation different point of view in song 1

Translation Procedures	ST	TT	ST's Literal Meaning
Modulation Different Point-of-View (POV)	1. <i>Kucoba untuk melawan hati</i> 2. <i>Tapi hampa terasa</i> 3. <i>Kuingin kau di sini tepiskan sepiku bersamamu</i>	1. I try to resist what my heart feels 2. But I'm falling to pieces 3. I need you here with me You brush away this loneliness from me	1. I try to resist the liver 2. But empty is felt 3. I want you here fend off my loneliness with you

In this song, there are three modulations in different POV that are found. The first one, the word “*hati*” is translated to “heart”. If the word “*hati*” in Indonesian is translated literally to English, it will be the internal organ “liver”. Both words, “*hati*” and “heart” in this context, are associated with love, not human organs. These words show different points of view on how Indonesian and English associate love, but when reading the text, the same meaning can still be acquired. Next is the word “*hampa*” to “falling”. In English, “*hampa*” means “empty” which is very different to the word “falling”. This shows the difference on how they express loneliness. Lastly, the word “*bersamamu*” is shifted to “from me”. In English the word “*bersamamu*” means “with you”, which creates a different distance to the translation “from me”.

1.b.4 Modulation different scope

Table 6. Modulation different scope in song 1

Translation Procedures	ST	TT	ST's Literal Meaning
Modulation Different Scope	1. <i>Segenap jiwa hanya untukmu</i> 2. <i>Kuingin kau disini</i>	1. Because all I am is just for you 2. I need you here with me	1. The entire soul is just for you 2. I want you here

For the modulation in a different scope, there are two examples found. First, the word “*jiwa*” which means “soul” in English is translated to “all I am”. It is clearly seen that the translator has changed the meaning because “all I am” means not only specifically his soul but also his physical body. Therefore, the meaning is changed from specific to general. Next, the word “*ingin*”, or “want” in English, is translated into “need”. In this example, the translator has changed the word in terms of degree of requirement. Whereas “want” means something that a person wishes to have, “need” means something that a person must have.

All in all, by looking at the translation methods and procedures used, it can be said that the foreign translator here respected and stayed loyal to the original song lyrics. From the length of the song lyrics to the overall translations, they are all identical to the original songs. However, although only in minor parts, some changes and shifts can still be found in order to make the translation more acceptable in the TL.

2. Song 2 “*Bila Aku Jatuh Cinta*”

Table 7. Translation of Song 2 “*Bila Aku Jatuh Cinta*”

ST	TT	ST’s Literal Meaning
<i>“Bila Aku Jatuh Cinta”</i>	<i>“Lights of Love”</i>	<i>“If I Fall in Love”</i>
<i>Bila aku jatuh cinta Aku mendengar nyanyian 1000 dewa dewi cinta Menggema dunia</i>	Kill me now because I am lonely I can hear a thousand songs Singing in salvation Shouting at the world	If I fall in love I hear the song of A thousand gods and goddesses of love Echoing the world
<i>Bila aku jatuh cinta Aku melihat matahari Kan datang padaku Dan memelukku dengan sayang</i>	As my soul begins to journey I can see the sun and glory Dancing with desires And blast me with the lights of love	If I fall in love I see the sun That will come to me And hug me dearly
<i>Bila aku jatuh cinta Aku melihat sang bulan Kan datang padaku Dan menemani aku</i>	Kiss me now because I’m lonely I can see a tears of hunger Open up your eyes Open up your heart	If I fall in love I see the moon Will come to me And accompany me
<i>Melewati dinginnya mimpi Melewati dinginnya mimpi</i>	And I lost for your love till I die And I lost for your love till I die	Getting through the coldness of dream Getting through the coldness of dream
<i>Bila aku jatuh cinta Jatuh cinta Bersama dirimu</i>	And now Since you in my hand Wake up now I’m feel the same Feel the same as one	If I fall in love Fall in love With you
<i>Peluk aku Dan ciumlah aku Sayang Sayang</i>	Wake me up Let us shine Let us shine Tonight Tonight	Hug me And kiss me Dear Dear

<i>Melewati dinginnya mimpi</i> <i>Melewati dinginnya mimpi</i>	And I lost for your love till I die And I lost for your love till I die	Getting through the coldness of dream Getting through the coldness of dream
<i>Bila aku jatuh cinta</i>	Kiss me now before I	If I fall in love

2.a. Translation Methods

2.a.1 Adaptation translation

Table 8. Adaptation translation methods in song 2

Translation Methods	ST	TT	ST's Literal Meaning
Adaptation Translation	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. "Bila Aku Jatuh Cinta" 2. <i>Bila Aku Jatuh Cinta</i> 3. <i>Melewati dinginnya mimpi</i> 4. <i>Kan datang padaku</i> 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. "Lights of Love" 2. Kill me now because I am lonely 3. And I lost for your love till I die 4. Dancing with desire 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. "If I Fall in Love" 2. If I fall in love 3. Getting through the coldness of dream 4. That will come to me

The second analysis showed an Indonesian song that is translated by a native Indonesian. In contrast to the first song, the methods of translation that are found in the song "*Bila Aku Jatuh Cinta*" and its English translation put more emphasis into the TL which can be seen from the first and dominant translation methods found, adaptation. When this song is seen as a whole, it can be said that the length of each stanza or verse is quite identical between the SL and the TL. However, when taking a more detailed look at this song, it can be inferred that the meaning from the SL is totally changed in the TL.

The first proof that shows adaptation methods used in this song can be seen in the title of the song itself, which is from "*Bila Aku Jatuh Cinta*" (literally "If I fall in Love") to "Lights of Love". Instead of using the literal meaning of the title, the translator chose to replace it with something that is totally different in meaning yet it still preserved the plot and theme of the song, which is about love. Next, the first line of the song, "*Bila aku jatuh cinta*", is translated to "Kill me now because I am lonely". "*Bila aku jatuh cinta*" as what has been mentioned before means "If I Fall in Love" or "When I Fall in Love" literally in English. This shows that the translator has changed the original lyrics to a translation that has no similarity in meaning and message. Another one can be found in the line "*Melewati dinginnya mimpi*" that is translated into "And I lost for your love till I die". The source language if being translated literally to English would mean "To get through the coldness of dream". Lastly, another indication of the adaptation methods can be seen in the line "*Kan datang padaku*". In English, this line means "Will come to me", but it is translated to "Dancing with desire" that has no similarity with the line in the SL. Those examples show that the target text deviates from the SL, particularly in terms of meaning.

2.a.2 Free translation

Table 9. Free translation methods in song 2

Translation Methods	ST	TT	ST's Literal Meaning
Free Translation	1. <i>Aku melihat matahari</i> 2. <i>Dan memelukku dengan sayang</i>	1. I can see the sun and glory 2. And blast me with the light of love	1. I see the sun 2. And hug me dearly

Although the length of the TL is quite similar to the SL if being seen as a whole, there are actually some lines where the translator added meanings to the translation. This shows that another methods of translation is used in this singable translation, which is the free translation methods.

There are two lines where the free translation methods can be found. In the line “*Aku melihat matahari*” (lit. “I see the sun”), the translator added meanings to the translation because he translated it to “I can see the sun and glory”. Meanwhile, there is no information about “glory” in the ST. Lastly, the line “*Dan memelukku dengan sayang*” (lit. “And hug me dearly”) is translated to “And blast me with the light of love”. As what can be seen in the SL, there is no information about “blast” and “light”. This shows that the translator put some additional messages in the translation.

2.b. Translation Procedures

2.b.1 Modulation different point of view

Table 10. Modulation different POV in song 2

Translation Procedures	ST	TT	ST's Literal Meaning
Modulation Different POV	1. <i>Aku mendengar nyanyian 1000 dewa dewi cinta</i> 2. <i>Dan memelukku dengan sayang</i>	1. I can hear a thousand songs singing in salvation 2. And blast me with the light of love	1. I hear the song of a thousand gods and goddesses of love 2. And hug me dearly

In this song and its English translation, there are no translation procedures that resemble the direct meaning of the SL. What can be found in this song are oblique translation procedures in which the translator interprets the original song. The first one to be discussed is modulation of a different point of view.

The line “*Aku mendengar nyanyian 1000 dewa dewi cinta*” (lit. “I hear the song of 1000 gods and goddesses of love”) is translated into “I can hear a thousand songs singing in salvation”. Gods and goddesses have different meanings to salvation. By this, it can be inferred that the translator sees gods and goddesses as something saving. Next, modulation of a different point of view can be found in the line “*Dan memelukku dengan sayang*” to “And blast me with the light of love”. The word “*memelukku*” means “hug me” in English. However, instead of using that translation, the translator chose to change it to “blast me”. In this example the difference between the word “hug” and “blast” is clear enough to spot. By hugging something, it means that the distance between a person and the thing being hugged

is getting shorter. Thus, if a person blasts something the distance between the person and the thing must be farther.

2.b.2 Modulation different scope

Table 11. Modulation different scope in song 2

Translation Procedures	ST	TT	ST's Literal Meaning
Modulation Different Scope	1. <i>Menggema dunia</i>	1. Shouting at the world	1. Echoing the world

The next modulation that will be discussed is a different scope. The example can be seen in the line "*Menggema dunia*" which means "echoing the world" literally in English. However, it is translated to "Shouting at the world" which is different from the SL. The verb echo, according to the Oxford dictionary means to send back or to repeat a sound. On the other hand, the verb shout according to the Oxford dictionary means to say something in a loud voice, which is harsher than echo. By this it can be seen that the translator changed the meaning from a word that is more subtle to a word that is harsher.

Taking everything into account, it can be said that the translation of this song departs considerably from the original lyrics. In other words, this translation can also be seen as a recreation of the original song. This most possibly happened since the original song lyricist and the translator are the same person and because of that, the translator knows exactly the soul of the song. Therefore, the translator owns the authority and the authorial status to reconstruct the song differently in another language (Chen, 2020).

5. Conclusion

Based on the findings in this research, it can be concluded that the singable translation of Indonesian songs made by a foreign translator is different from the translation made by an Indonesian translator. The song translation made by a foreign translator is more faithful to the SL, in this case Indonesian, by looking at the entirety of the translation which only uses faithful translation methods. By this, it can be said that the foreign translator respects and stays loyal to the SL in order to preserve the true meaning of the song. In contrast, the findings of this research show that the song translation made by an Indonesian translator leans more on the TL, which is English. This can be seen from the translation methods used, which are adaptation and free translation methods. As a result, the translation made by an Indonesian translator conveyed a different meaning to the original text while still preserving the genre and plot of the song. These findings propose similar results to what have been previously found by Åkerström (2009), Anggasta and Pattinasarany (2013), and Laurer (2019) about the use and number of paraphrasing in song translations. However, in Nidji's translation the number of paraphrasing is more than the other song which is in line with what Chen (2020) has suggested about self-translation.

Despite all the differences found between the singable translation of Indonesian songs to English made by a foreign translator and an Indonesian translator, there are also some similarities between those two. Both translations are singable and as what has been mentioned before, the two translations can be sung using the same melody as their original songs. Other than that, both translations have identical length of line and stanza to its original songs.

This research about Indonesian song translations, however, requires further investigation since this research is very limited in scope. This research has only used two corpora as the main data for the research. Therefore, it should be noted that the results provided only refer to the corpora of texts that have been worked on. Different results can possibly appear when the theory is applied on different corpora, for example if the translator is a native of the SL but not necessarily the original song lyricist. Thus, future studies on song translations that involve more song lyrics and translations as the corpora might provide different results.

References

- Anggasta, G. & Pattinasarany, M. (2013). *Analisis Teknik Terjemahan Padanan Leksikal Lagu Populer Amerika dalam Bahasa Jerman*. Depok: Universitas Indonesia.
- Åkerström, J. (2009). *Translating Song Lyrics*. Sodertorn: Sodertorn University.
- Chen, Y. (2020). *Corpora-based Investigations into the Differences in Translation Styles between Translators and Self-translators in SKASE Journal of Translation and Interpretation*. 13: 1. Singapore.
- Desblache, L. (2019). *Music and Translation: New mediation in the digital age* (pp.284). Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Hatim, B. & Munday, J. (2004). *Definitions of Translation in Translation: An advanced resource book* (pp.3-10). New York: Routledge.
- Laurer, J. (2019). *The translation in Song Lyrics in Popular Music: German Lyrics and their Translation into English*. Smaland: Linnaeus University.
- Low, P. (2005). The Pentathlon Approach to Translating Songs in *Song and Significance: Virtues and Vices of Vocal Translation* (pp. 185-212). New York: Rodopi.
- Low, P. (2008). *Translating Songs that Rhyme, Perspectives: Studies in Translatology* (pp.1-20). DOI: 10.1080/13670050802364437.
- Low, P. (2017). *Translating Song Lyrics and Texts*. New York: Routledge.
- Matkivska, N. (2014). *Audiovisual Translation: Conception, Types, Characters' Speech and Translation Strategies Applied* (pp.1-3). Ukraine: Kyiv National Linguistic University
- Mazni, Murni D. & Pohan, E. (2018). *Method of Translation in An Error Analysis of Indonesian-English Translation by Using Song Lyric at the Tenth Grade Students of SMA Negeri 4 Tanjungpinang* (pp.4-5). Tanjung Pinang: Universitas Maritim Raja Ali Haji.
- Newmark, P. (1988). *Translation Methods in A Textbook of Translation* (pp.45-48). New York: Prentice HaH International vUIO Ltd.
- Sebnem, S. (2008). *Translation and Music: Changing Perspectives, Frameworks and Significance. The Translator: Translation and Music*. 14:2 (pp.187-200). Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing.
- Vinay, J.-P., & Darbelnet, J. (1958/2000). *A Methodology for Translation. [An excerpt from Comparative Stylistics of French and English: A Methodology for Translation, trans. and eds. J. C. Sager & M.-J. Hamel, Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 1995, first published in 1958 as Stylistique comparée du français et de l'anglais. Méthodede traduction] In L. Venuti (Ed.), The Translation Studies Reader* (pp. 84–93). London: Routledge.
- Vinay, J.-P., & Darbelnet, J. (1995). *A Methodology for Translation*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Walinski, J. (2015). *Translation Procedures* (pp.58-64). Lodz: University of Lodz.